CACR - MCA - Depot Road Access
Option under Consideration

	Parameter		Criteria	Sub-Criteria (Quantitative/ Qualitative)	Option 1A	Rating	Option 2	Rating	Option 3	Rating	Option 4	Rating	Option 5	Rating	Option 6	Rating	Option 7	Rating	Option 8	Rating
					Do-Management								Do-Something							
				Quantatitive Comparison	Online Management Option utilising existing roads with access to the depot via connection of Ballybrichet More Road to accommodate low-loaders. (discrete exercise - 100 deliveries) Option passes through Carrigacrottel centre 4.4km length. Day-to-day traffic (typical, circa 20 deliveries over 24hrs, shift working) will use local access roads, most vehicles have to use western access to Carrigacrottel off N25 (route 2.7km). Local roads vary in width with Type 2/3 Single Carriageway road widths. Existing NMU facilities available through Carrigacrottel Option terminates at N25 interchange tie-in. 1 existing bridge over rail (C8/171) widening will be required, opportunity taken to improve bridge to provide improved active travel facilities. Bridge widening - resulting in enhanced connectivity to local active travel facilities - cycle and pedestrian, safety improvements along Carrigacre Road in vicinity of C8/171. Western access to depot site off Carrigacre Road. The principal route for construction traffic accessing the depot site proposed to be directly off the N25 and via the existing accommodation bridge east of the interconnector site. Cleaning of construction vehicles prior to use on the public road network. Option provides for improvement to Carrigacre Road alignment on approach to widened C8/171, partial construction of permitted UR/DF and enhanced active travel linkages with the construction of pedestrian and cycle links		Online Management Option utilising existing roads with access to the depot via connection of Ballybrichet More Road to accommodate low-loaders. Option passes through Middleton centre. 6.6km length through urban area Local roads vary in widths with Type 2/3 Single Carriageway road widths Existing NMU facilities available on Upper Mill Road and through Middleton Other One-way access to N25 interchange NMU facilities provided for entire route to depot and terminates at N25 Junction tie-in This option utilises existing bridge C8/168 which already incorporates NMU facilities This option utilises existing Ballybrichet Bridge (NAH:2080610) on Upper Mill Road. This option will require the planned active travel route to be diverted around the northern boundary of the depot. The principal route for construction traffic accessing the depot site to be directly off the N25 and via the existing accommodation bridge east of the interconnector site.		Online Management Option utilising existing roads with access to the depot via connection of Ballybrichet More Road to accommodate low-loaders. Option passes through Middleton centre 6.6km length through urban area Local roads vary in widths with Type 2/3 Single Carriageway road widths Existing NMU facilities available on Upper Mill Road and through Middleton Other One-way access to N25 interchange NMU facilities provided for entire route to depot and terminates at N25 Junction tie-in This option utilises existing bridge C8/168 which already incorporates NMU facilities This option utilises existing Ballybrichet Bridge (NAH:2080610) on Upper Mill Road. This option will require the planned active travel route to be diverted around the northern boundary of the depot. The principal route for construction traffic accessing the depot site to be directly off the N25 and via the existing accommodation bridge east of the interconnector site.		Online Option accommodating low-loaders and wider cross-section for active travel/greenway integration. Existing Access off the N25 substandard - Safety concerns re residents west of this access. Left-in Left-out access to N25 from Ballybrichet Industrial Access. Existing road network requires widening. 2.8km Length Type 2 Single Carriageway Left-in Left-out access to N25 from 1.7km/Industrial Access. 2.8km Length Type 2 Single Carriageway Left-in Left-out access to N25 from 1.7km/Industrial Access. NMU facilities provided for entire road to depot and terminates at N25 Junction tie-in. 1 existing bridge over rail (C8/97) widening/reconstruction will be required. Bridge widening - resulting in enhanced connectivity to local active travel bridge and to improve the road alignment as per the permitted UR/DF. Access to Depot off Carrigacre Road west of the depot site. Access from high level to construction appropriate and to avoid alignment requires material excavation and disposal. Affects Wining bridge and Wining Lane. The principal route for construction traffic accessing the depot site to be directly off the N25 and via the existing accommodation bridge east of the interconnector site.		Partially Offline Option with tie-ins to existing roads also accommodating low-loaders and wider cross-section for active travel/greenway integration. Existing Access off the N25 substandard - Safety concerns re residents west of this access. Left-in Left-out access to N25 from 1.7km/Industrial Access. 2.8km Length Type 2 Single Carriageway Left-in Left-out access to N25 from 1.7km/Industrial Access. 2.8km Length Type 2 Single Carriageway Left-in Left-out access to N25 from 1.7km/Industrial Access. NMU facilities provided for entire route to depot and terminates at N25 Junction tie-in. New bridge (11km long) required over the railway and the depot site. This option will require the planned active travel route to be diverted around the northern boundary of the depot. Affects Wining bridge and Wining Lane. New bridge (11km long) required over railway and depot. New bridge over existing dual carriageway roadway.		Proposed Offline Option with tie-ins to existing roads also accommodating low-loaders and wider cross-section for active travel/greenway integration. 1.6km length Type 2 Single Carriageway One-way access to N25 from raised roundabouts NMU facilities only provided on access road to depot and terminates at N25 Junction tie-in. Requires construction of grade separated interchange on the N25 with four slips onto the existing dual carriageway. Affects at least 2No.domestic direct accesses onto the dual carriageway. Affects IW and MVLV overhead lines. Affects Wining bridge and Wining Lane. Affects existing railway line and railway station. New bridge (11km long) required over railway and depot. New bridge over existing dual carriageway roadway.		Partially Offline Option with tie-ins to existing roads also accommodating low-loaders and wider cross-section for active travel/greenway integration. 1.6km length Type 2 Single Carriageway One-way access to N25 from raised roundabouts NMU facilities only provided on access road to depot and terminates at N25 Junction tie-in. 2No. junction alterations and, road widening required by 1.0m to accommodate carriage deliveries. Flood risk identified in fields at two locations along the proposed alignment. The principal route for construction traffic accessing the depot site proposed to be directly off the N25 and via the existing accommodation bridge east of the interconnector site.		Partially Offline Option with tie-ins to existing roads also accommodating low-loaders and wider cross-section for active travel/greenway integration. 3.8km length through residential area under construction (Waterrock level crossing likely to be closed by CCC) Type 2 Single Carriageway Roundabout access from Northern Relief Road onto L3618 Castle-Rock Avenue This option allows existing bridge C8/168 which already incorporates NMU facilities NMU facilities provided on access road to depot and terminates at N25 Junction Tie-in. 2No. junction alterations and, road widening required by 1.0m to accommodate carriage deliveries. Flood risk identified in fields at two locations along the proposed alignment. The principal route for construction traffic accessing the depot site proposed to be directly off the N25 and via the existing accommodation bridge east of the interconnector site.		Partially Offline Option with tie-ins to existing roads also accommodating low-loaders and wider cross-section for active travel/greenway integration. 3.8km length through residential area under construction (Waterrock level crossing likely to be closed by CCC) Type 2 Single Carriageway Roundabout access from Northern Relief Road onto L3618 Castle-Rock Avenue One-way access to N25 interchange This option allows existing bridge C8/168 which already incorporates NMU facilities NMU facilities provided on access road to depot and terminates at N25 Junction Tie-in. 1 junction modification required Flood risk identified in fields at one location along the proposed alignment. The principal route for construction traffic accessing the depot site proposed to be directly off the N25 and via the existing accommodation bridge east of the interconnector site.	
1	Transport User Benefits and Other Economic Impacts	1.1	Staff and Delivery Access Quality	Measure of the direct impact on the amount of time people spend travelling. Delour lengths, Quality of Access	4 - Slightly Beneficial Impact Journey length from N25 - 3.0km for regular depot traffic. Provides improved access quality with principal access route at eastern extent of Carrigahorrib while facilitating link to permitted active travel facilities. Provides improved access quality with improved Carrigacrottel interchange to depot on the N25 to the south of Ballybrichet/Ballina. The proposed upgrade to C8/97 would accommodate such provision. Utilises existing carriageway, which should carriageway capacity of DRIV. Requires access through Carrigahorrib and Carrigacrottel centre (Main Street) commercial area. Proposals to widen C8/97 will provide for enhancement to NMU and Active Travel linkages and road safety improvements.	3	Journey length from N25 - 5.0km Utilises existing carriageway, which does not allow for HGVs to pass each other without stopping Requires modification of 2 junctions on L3618 Requires access through Middleton, L3618 Water-Rock, Ballybrichet More Road and L3617 Curragh with significant traffic management for livestock transit.	4 - Slightly Beneficial Impact Journey length from N25 - 7.102km Utilises existing carriageway, which does not allow for HGVs to pass each other without stopping Requires modification of 2 junctions on L3618 Requires access through Middleton, L3618 Water-Rock, Ballybrichet More Road, L3617 Curragh & Upper Mill Road with significant traffic management for livestock transit. Option will require alteration of existing infrastructure particularly at junctions in Middleton where central reserves and traffic signals will be impacted	4 - Slightly Beneficial Impact Journey length from N25 - 7.102km Utilises existing carriageway, which does not allow for HGVs to pass each other without stopping Requires modification of 2 junctions on L3618 Requires access through Middleton, and through L3618 Water-Rock, Ballybrichet More Road, L3617 Curragh & Upper Mill Road with significant traffic management for livestock transit. Option will require alteration of existing infrastructure particularly at junctions in Middleton where central reserves and traffic signals will be impacted	3 - Slightly Beneficial Impact Detour length 2.8km Provides improved access quality with wider 7m carriageway for HGVs to pass each other without stopping Requires online widening of L7842 Utilises L7842 and Ballybrichet Road alignment but requires localised alignment alterations in proximity to interconnector site and a new bridge across the rail line Provides access off widened N25 Brick Road. Three junction alterations and widening of N25 Brick Road. This junction will require alterations to accommodate carriage deliveries and presents safety challenges in respect of properties immediately west of the junction accessing the N25. The configuration is left in, left out meaning traffic from the west of the site will have to travel longer routes to reach the stadium. A currently at capacity. Tri-has objection is intensification of access on this junction.	3 - Negative Impact Estimated Capital Cost > 1150% Journey length from N25 - 1.6km Provides improved access quality with wider 7m carriageway for HGVs to pass each other without stopping Requires online widening of L7842 Utilises L7842 and industrial estate local road alignment Requires localised alignment alterations in proximity to interconnector site and a new bridge across the rail line Provides access off widened N25 Brick Road. Three junction alterations and widening of N25 Brick Road. This junction will require alterations to accommodate carriage deliveries and presents safety challenges in respect of properties immediately west of the junction accessing the N25. The configuration is left in, left out meaning traffic from the west of the site will have to travel longer routes to reach the stadium. A currently at capacity. Tri-has objection is intensification of access on this junction.	2 - Negative Impact Estimated Capital Cost > 1150% Journey length from N25 - 2.8km Provides improved access quality with 7m carriageway for HGVs to pass each other without stopping Requires online widening of L7842 Utilises L7842 and industrial estate local road alignment Requires localised alignment alterations in proximity to interconnector site and a new bridge across the rail line Provides access off widened N25 Brick Road. Three junction alterations and widening of N25 Brick Road. This junction will require alterations to accommodate carriage deliveries and presents safety challenges in respect of properties immediately west of the junction accessing the N25. The configuration is left in, left out meaning traffic from the west of the site will have to travel longer routes to reach the stadium. A currently at capacity. Tri-has objection is intensification of access on this junction.	2 - Negative Impact Estimated Capital Cost > 350% Journey length from N25 - 5.6km Provides improved access quality with 7m carriageway for HGVs to pass each other without stopping Requires modification of 2 junctions on L3618 Requires online widening of L3618 Requires access through Middleton, L3618 Water-Rock, Ballybrichet More Road and L3617 Curragh Provides access through Carrigacrottel centre (Main Street) (Waterrock level crossing likely to be closed by CCC)	4 - Slightly Beneficial Impact Estimated Capital Cost > 750% 3.8km length through residential area under construction (Waterrock level crossing likely to be closed by CCC) Provides improved access quality with 7m carriageway for HGVs to pass each other without stopping Requires modification of 2 junctions on L3618 Requires online widening of L3618 Requires access through Middleton, L3618 Water-Rock and L3617 Curragh Provides facilities and segregation for non-motorised users only along detour length over portion of route, remainder in place.
		1.2	CAPEX and OPEX	Transportation Costs based on CAPEX captures using Capital Cost only for road users In respect of OPEX costs it is assumed that for all options the access roads will be taken in charge by the local authority.	3 - Slightly Negative Impact Estimated Capital Cost > 700% Estimated Capital Cost represents CAPEX based on: Construction cost Accommodation Works Administration Archaeology and Heritage Surveys 40 (Using Existing Road network) Traffic Management Land Costs: 40 (Using Existing Road network) Bridge reconstruction required, short-term impact on rail and road users during construction	4 - Neutral Impact Estimated Capital Cost < 100% Estimated Capital Cost represents CAPEX based on: Construction cost Accommodation Works Administration Archaeology and Heritage Surveys: 40 (Using Existing Road network) Traffic Management Land Costs: 412,5120 (One property is impacted to allow for low-loader manoeuvre)	4 - Neutral Impact Estimated Capital Cost < 120% Estimated Capital Cost represents CAPEX based on: Construction cost Accommodation Works Administration Archaeology and Heritage Surveys: 40 (Using Existing Road network) Traffic Management Land Costs: 40 (Using Existing Road network)	3 - Slightly Negative Impact Estimated Capital Cost < 600% Estimated Capital Cost represents CAPEX based on: Construction cost Accommodation Works Administration Archaeology and Heritage Surveys Traffic Management Land Costs Bridge reconstruction required, short-term impact on rail and road users during construction Environmental Costs: Earthworks (Cut) Earthworks (Cut - Of Material) Earthworks (Fill)	3 - Negative Impact Estimated Capital Cost < 1150% Estimated Capital Cost represents CAPEX based on: Construction cost Accommodation Works Administration Archaeology and Heritage Surveys Traffic Management Land Costs Bridge reconstruction required, short-term impact on rail and road users during construction Environmental Costs: Earthworks (Cut) Earthworks (Cut - Of Material) Earthworks (Fill)	2 - Negative Impact Estimated Capital Cost < 350% Estimated Capital Cost represents CAPEX based on: Construction cost Accommodation Works Administration Archaeology and Heritage Surveys Traffic Management Land Costs 2 Bridges Construction required, short-term impact on rail and road users during construction 2 Roundabouts Construction required Environmental Costs: Earthworks (Cut) Earthworks (Cut - Of Material) Earthworks (Fill)	2 - Slightly Negative Impact Estimated Capital Cost < 350% Estimated Capital Cost represents CAPEX based on: Construction cost Accommodation Works Administration Archaeology and Heritage Surveys Traffic Management Land Costs Environmental Costs: Earthworks (Cut) Earthworks (Cut - Of Material) Earthworks (Fill)	2 - Slightly Negative Impact Estimated Capital Cost < 750% Estimated Capital Cost represents CAPEX based on: Construction cost Accommodation Works Administration Archaeology and Heritage Surveys Traffic Management Land Costs Environmental Costs: Earthworks (Cut) Earthworks (Cut - Of Material) Earthworks (Fill)
		1.3	Change of Land Value	Positive or Negative impacts on Land Value consequent the depot delivery enabling the introduction of the CACR service	5 - Slightly Beneficial Impact The introduction of the CACR service will lead to an increase in property values proximal to the railway. This impact is across the whole of the CACR Network and arises from the delivery of a depot which the access roads are an essential part of. The outcome is independent of site location. The positive impact rating is common for all options.